CULTURAL HERITAGE & CULTURAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

Dr. Johannes Parlindungan
Can't they read?
Culture:
The whole complex of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features that characterize a society or social group. It includes not only arts and letters, but also modes of life, the fundamental rights of the human being, value systems, traditions and beliefs (UNESCO. 1982. Mexico city declaration on cultural policies)

Cultural Impact Assessment (CIA):
A process of evaluating the likely impacts of a proposed development on the way of life of a particular group or community of people, with full involvement of this group or community of people and possibly undertaken by this group or community of people.
CIA is also often discussed as a sub-dimension of SIA.
Tantangan dan permasalahan global terkait cagar budaya

- Ketika meratifikasi konvensi warisan dunia (World Heritage / WH), pemerintah nasional setuju untuk memastikan identifikasi, perlindungan dan pelestarian WH (Roders, 2012)
- Sebagian besar ancaman ini diakibatkan oleh kegagalan manajemen (lingkungan dan proyek) dan pembangunan yang agresif (Roders, 2012)
Unesco’s HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT

- Potential threats should be anticipated in the management system in a property-specific way – not “one size fits all”
- A large number of World Heritage properties do not have a well-functioning management system
- There are many ways of assessing impact on heritage assets, some formalised in law, some very technical and sophisticated, others less so. This guidance sets down some principles and options

Assessment process:
- What is the heritage at risk and why is it important – how does it contribute to OUV?
- How will change or a development proposal impact on OUV?
- How can these effects be avoided, reduced, rehabilitated or compensated?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VALUE OF HERITAGE ASSET</th>
<th>SCALE AND SEVERITY OF CHANGE / IMPACT</th>
<th>SIGNIFICANCE OF EFFECT OR OVERALL IMPACT (EITHER ADVERSE OR BENEFICIAL)</th>
<th>SIGNIFICANCE OF IMPACT (EITHER ADVERSE OR BENEFICIAL)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For WH properties: Very High (attributes which convey OUV)</td>
<td>No Change</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Very Large</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Negligible Change</td>
<td>Slight</td>
<td>Large / Very Large</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minor Change</td>
<td>Moderate / Large</td>
<td>Very Large</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moderate Change</td>
<td>Large / Very Large</td>
<td>Very Large</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Major Change</td>
<td>Very Large</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For other heritage assets or attributes</td>
<td>Very high</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Very Large</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Slight</td>
<td>Moderate / Large</td>
<td>Large / Very Large</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moderate / Slight</td>
<td>Large / Very Large</td>
<td>Very Large</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Large / Slight</td>
<td>Very Large</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Slight</td>
<td>Moderate / Large</td>
<td>Large / Very Large</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moderate / Slight</td>
<td>Very Large</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Neutral / Slight</td>
<td>Slight / Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Slight</td>
<td>Neutral / Slight</td>
<td>Slight / Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Negligible</td>
<td>Neutral / Slight</td>
<td>Slight / Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

WH = World Heritage
OUV = Outstanding Universal Value

BEBERAPA MODEL HIA dan CIA
**HIA in Wales**

**Heritage impact assessment** is a structured process to make sure that you take the significance of your historic asset into account when you are developing and designing proposals for change.

---

**Process**

1. Explaining objectives
2. Understanding significance
3. Identifying proposed changes
4. Assessing the impact of the proposals
5. Getting the best solution

---

*Welsh Government. 2017. Heritage Impact Assessment in Wales*
**Project:** Pembangunan gedung di sekitar bangunan cagar budaya

**PROCESS**

01. Assessment of existing condition
02. Policy review (Heritage conservation)
03. Statement of significance
04. Description of proposed development
05. Impact of development
06. Conservation strategy
Above: 698 Spadina Avenue, with its principal (east) elevation facing Spadina Avenue and side (south) elevation facing Sussex Avenue, (Heritage Preservation Services [HPS], 2016)
Cover: Photograph of 698 Spadina Avenue taken in 1972
(City of Toronto Archives [CTA], Fonds 2032, Series 641, File 55, Item 13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>698 Spadina Avenue - John James Funston Grocery Store/Ten Editions Bookstore</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ADDRESS</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>WARD</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LEGAL DESCRIPTION</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HISTORICAL NAME</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONSTRUCTION DATE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ORIGINAL OWNER</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ORIGINAL USE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CURRENT USE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION/MATERIALS</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ARCHITECTURAL STYLE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CRITERIA</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HERITAGE STATUS</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RECORDER</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>REPORT DATE</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Project: the recovery of Lyttleton Port

CIA purpose: To assess the potential effects of the proposed recovery and expansion activities on Ngai Tahu values and interests associated with Whakaraupo.

*Whakaraupo* is cultural landscape with a long and rich history of Ngai Tahu (a native community) land use and occupancy, and strong tradition of *mahinga kai*. Ngai Tahu have lived and fished in this harbour for generations.

HOW:
- Melibatkan “traditional authority”
- Memahami nilai arkeologis dan tradisi dari lokasi
Perbandingan Model Analisa

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KASUS</th>
<th>PERBEDAAN</th>
<th>PERSAMAAN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wales</td>
<td>• Official heritage</td>
<td>• Bagian dari proses EIA dari suatu proyek</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Pendekatan teknokrat</td>
<td>• Tahap mengenali nilai budaya/sejarah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>• Official heritage</td>
<td>• Tahap mengenali dampak proyek</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Pendekatan teknokrat</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>• Official dan unofficial heritages</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Pendekatan kolaboratif</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Official heritage**: cagar budaya (heritage) yang secara resmi diproteksi oleh pemerintah, yang meliputi perlindungan hukum, kebijakan publik dan keterlibatan ahli dalam assessment dan dokumentasi

**Unofficial heritage**: cagar budaya (heritage) yang secara tidak secara resmi diproteksi oleh pemerintah tapi dianggap bernilai oleh warga (publik), biasanya terkait legenda, mitos atau nilai sejarah/budaya yang tidak tercatat secara resmi.
PELUANG
PENGEMBANGAN METODE
A socio-semiotic investigation of historic areas in Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Yogyakarta sebagai kota tradisional dan kolonial

Yogyakarta sebagai kota kontemporer
Socio-Semiotics

Pendekatan textual dalam Cultural Studies

Semiotics: mempelajari makna (meaning) yang dihasilkan oleh text melalui susunan penanda (signs) dan kode-kode budaya (cultural codes)

Meaning: narasi atau ide yang diwakili oleh representasi (dalam kajian ini, representasi / material culture adalah perwujudan fisik dari ide)


Sistem pemaknaan dijelaskan dalam tiga komponen:
- **Expression**: material culture (physical representations)
- **Content**: meanings
- **Exo-semotics**: the social, economic and political relations which shape material culture
Premis

EXO-SEMIOTICS

EXPRESSIONS

Mempengaruhi paradigma berpikir dalam memaknai

Mempengaruhi susunan morfologi kota

Dimaknai oleh pengamat

Perwujudan fisik morfologi kota: Pola jalan, pola land use dan bangunan

Makna:
• Makna kontemporer ruang, sejarah dan budaya
• Lokalitas kawasan dan kota

Parlindungan, Johannes (2018) *The meaning change of urban heritage: A socio-semiotic investigation of historic areas in Yogyakarta, Indonesia*
Analisa dan Hasil

Expression
Physical characteristics of street, land use and building type

EXO-SEMIOTICS
• Capitalism
• Global market

Consistent exposure to citizens and visitors

CONTENTS
• Modernity and globalisation
• Secularism

Using the strategic location for commercial purpose
Mass production of commercial signs

Parlindungan, Johannes (2018) The meaning change of urban heritage: A socio-semiotic investigation of historic areas in Yogyakarta, Indonesia
• Heritage conservation & HUL

EXO-SEMIOTICS
• Past-romanticism
• Government’s hegemony
• Heritage tourism

Consistent exposure to citizens and visitors

CONTENTS
• Traditional philosophy, myths
• Colonisation
• Nationalism
• Pride
• Subjective identity

Expression
Physical characteristics of street, land use and building type

Parlindungan, Johannes (2018) The meaning change of urban heritage: A socio-semiotic investigation of historic areas in Yogyakarta, Indonesia
P O L A R I T Y

- Secularism, profane
- Global world
- Rejecting tradition
- Utility function

- Traditional philosophy, sacred
- Local ‘singularity’
- Prolonging tradition, nationalism
- Symbolic function

HYPO-SYGNIFICANT?
(A situation where the symbolic meanings are replaced by economic utility)
Parlindungan, Johannes (2018) *The meaning change of urban heritage: A socio-semiotic investigation of historic areas in Yogyakarta, Indonesia*
### Planning types

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planning types</th>
<th>Critical aspects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project assessment</td>
<td>Heritage and cultural impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic planning</td>
<td>• Internal &amp; external influences&lt;br&gt;• Social agents&lt;br&gt;• City branding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaborative planning</td>
<td>• Potential conflicts&lt;br&gt;• Social agents’ values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tactical urbanism</td>
<td>• Contextual analysis &amp; design&lt;br&gt;• Community actions and engagement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>